



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, May 10, 2011

2:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order
Pledge of Allegiance
Roll Call

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, Bryan Green and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Patrick Wright.

Approval of Agenda

Nils Muench requested to add a discussion of demolition by neglect under Commissioners Comments.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

Approval of Minutes **1 April 12, 2011**

Nils Muench stated that the approval needed to be added to Item 10. Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

Action Items

Old Business

- 2** Proposed revisions to guidelines- Exterior colors in the historic district and installation of solar devices.

Enid Torregrosa presented the revisions to the guidelines.

Public Comment:

Jed Regante, 1612 United Street.

David Dlugitch, 1213 Watson Street.

Carlos Rojas stated that he was concerned with putting a company name in the guidelines. He then discussed the tradition of unpainted houses in Key West.

Ron Ramsingh stated the guidelines could have the color listed as “similar to” or list similar colors in the language.

Bryan Green stated that he was not in support of regulating colors.

Daniel Metzler suggested that on page 26 the word modern should be struck from the language concerning skylights.

Nils Muench suggested that the term “natural finish” used in the guidelines should be replaced with “unpainted”.

Rudy Molinet stated that he felt color regulation in the historic district was necessary, but there should be a balance when to regulate colors.

Bryan Green suggested that unfinished wood be used where appropriate.

Daniel Metzler suggested there be a safety net in the regulations concerning the regulation of extreme colors.

Carlos Rojas suggested a list of appropriate colors, and any color proposed outside the list must go before HARC.

Bryan Green reviewed his wording for the revisions to the guidelines concerning solar panels.

Carlos Rojas stated that some properties are not suitable for solar panels.

Ron Ramsingh reviewed State Statute 163.04.

Rudy Molinet stated that the project should be looked at in totality. He added that the calculation of outputs should add to the mitigation of carbon footprint and other green building efforts.

Bryan Green made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

POSTPONED

3 Replace 38 existing windows; replace rotted siding and paint - #1122 Watson Street- Kim Fisher (H11-01-490)

Enid Torregrosa reviewed the current status of the application.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

POSTPONED

4 Revision to application H11-01-402 for demolition of existing garage and replacement- #730 Southard Street- Thomas E. Pope (H11-01-507)

Thomas Pope presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report, she stated that this was the second reading for demolition.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green for discussion.

Nils Muench stated that the demolition of the historic structure is not justified.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Muench

APPROVED

New Business

5 Demolition of back shed and two story addition at rear- #617 Mickens Lane- Michael Skoglund (H11-01-431)

Michael Skoglund presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green stated that the addition was disproportionate in size and height.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny based on page 37 of the guidelines numbers 3, 4, and 6; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler for discussion.

Carlos Rojas stated that the house was set back to appear smaller.

Rudy Molinet stated that he felt the addition was too large, he added that the width created an overwhelming size in comparison to the contributing structure.

Daniel Metzler stated the addition is dominating the historic structure.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

6 Relocate a one single family frame structure- From 819 Olivia Street to 1018 White Street- City of Key West (H11-01-536)

Rod Delostrinos, City of Key West Public Works, presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

7 Revisions to previously approved plans including back dormer, window and door manufacturer, addition of a back porch at the second level- #1415 Olivia Street- David Knoll (H11-01-539)

David Knoll presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench stated that he felt the changes proposed pushed mass and scale over the limit.

Bryan Green and Daniel Metzler stated they were in support of approval.

Carlos Rojas expressed concern for how the second floor porch would affect neighbors.

Alan Suggs stated that the mass and scale are not changing, and the porch addition was for guests who smoke. He then showed the commissioners photos of the view of the proposed porch.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Muench

APPROVED

- 8** Remove shed roof on back and install gable roof, new dormer on back of main house, small alteration to back portion of roof to accommodate headroom for stairs, changes on some doors and windows- **#1411 Petronia Street- Thomas Kelly (H11-01-557)**

Thomas Kelly presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed the project

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

HARC Planner's Report

Enid Torregrosa updated commissioners on the RFP ranking process.

Ron Ramsingh updated commissioners on the HARC membership and notification revisions to the ordinance.

Comments from Commissioners

Nils Muench stated that the guidelines on page 54 state that demolition by neglect is in violation of the city code. He stated that the commission needs to address this language and either allow or find a course of action to save some of these historic structures.

The commissioners discussed and gave examples of the issue of demolition by neglect.

Ron Ramsingh stated that he would look into a course of action concerning demolition by neglect and would report back in July.

Adjournment

Carlos Rojas made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.